

PROFICIENCY TEST « RAEMA »

aema
réseau d'analyses et d'échanges en microbiologie des aliments

SCHEME N° 75 A (5th DECEMBER 2022) GENERAL REPORT

« Any reproduction of the report must be made in its entirety »

« The Cofrac logo may not be used outside this report »

« The general report is public, it is available on the Website of ASA, results and informations are anonymous, they do not contain any confidential information »

V. CARLIER⁽¹⁾, L. ALI-MANDJEE et M. CARLIER

ASA – Bât. Jean Girard, ENVA, 7 avenue du Général de Gaulle, 94704 MAISONS ALFORT CEDEX

⁽¹⁾ Coordinator of the proficiency test « RAEMA »

For any claim, you can use the specific form available on our Website
<https://association.asa-spv.fr>

Table of contents

1- GENERAL DATA	3
1-1 PARTICIPATING LABORATORIES.....	3
1-2 DELIVERY TIME OF THE PARCEL.....	3
1-3 INFORMATION ABOUT SAMPLE	3
1-3-1 NATURE	3
1-3-2 SIZE	3
1-3-3 HOMOGENEITY AND STABILITY OF THE CONTAMINATION	3
1-3-4 FLORA FOR ENUMERATION	3
1-4 EXECUTION OF ANALYSIS.....	4
1-4-1 PRESERVATION TEMPERATURE OF SAMPLE BEFORE ANALYSIS	4
2- EXPLOITATION OF ANALYSIS REPORT	4
2-1 SIZE OF TEST SAMPLES.....	4
2-2 PREPARATION OF THE INITIAL SUSPENSION	4
2-3 DILUENT USED FOR THE INITIAL SUSPENSION	4
2-4 HOMOGENEIZATION TECHNIQUE	4
2-5 LACTIC ACID BACTERIA	5
2-6 PSEUDOMONAS	6
2-7 BACILLUS CEREUS	7
2-8 YEAST / MOULDS	8
2-9 YEAST	9
2-10 MOULDS	10
3- ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE.....	11
3-1 LACTIC ACID BACTERIA	12
3-2 PSEUDOMONAS	12
3-3 BACILLUS CEREUS	12
3-4 YEAST / MOULDS	13
3-5 YEAST	13
3-6 MOULDS	13
3-7 EVOLUTION OF PERFORMANCE	13

1. GENERAL DATA

1.1. PARTICIPATING LABORATORIES

145 laboratories participated to the 75Ath Gel scheme on 5th December 2022 (J0). We received 143 answers.

1.2. DELIVERY TIME OF THE PARCEL

Delivery time	J0	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+8	J0+9	J0+14
Nb of laboratories	2	77	42	7	7	4	2	1

1.3. INFORMATIONS ABOUT SAMPLE

1.3.1. NATURE

- one sample included a strain of *Lactobacillus plantarum* at a concentration level of 7.10^5 cfu/g ;
- one sample included a strain of *Pseudomonas* sp. at a concentration level of 1.10^4 cfu/g ;
- one sample included a strain of *Bacillus cereus* at a concentration level of 6.10^4 cfu/g ;
- one sample included a strain of *Penicillium* at a concentration level of 4.10^3 cfu/g and a strain of *Rhodotorula rubra* at a concentration level of 1.10^4 cfu/g ;

1.3.2. SIZE

Samples were composed of a gel and distributed in bottles containing 50 grammes.

1.3.3. HOMOGENEITY AND STABILITY TEST OF THE CONTAMINATION

A check of the contamination's homogeneity was realized on 10 samples per numeration in duplicate for all flora.

The contamination's stability was checked by enumeration of all flora on 8 December (J0+3), 12 December (J0+7) and 19 December 2022 (J0+14).

These checks were realized by a subcontractor accredited by Cofrac for *Bacillus cereus*, lactic bacteria and Yeast/Mould. The check of *Pseudomonas* was realized by the same subcontractor but not covered by Cofrac accreditation.

Homogeneity of samples has been validated except for *Pseudomonas* and Yeast. For these parameters, inter-samples standard deviation has been included in the calculation of standard deviation for proficiency assessment (ISO 13528 §B.2.5.a).

Stability of samples has been validated except for Moulds. In accordance with the MET50_P1g procedure, the impact has been assessed; there is no impact on participants' results.

1.3.4 FLORA FOR ENUMERATION

Enumeration of the following flora was proposed:

- lactic acid bacteria
- *Pseudomonas*
- *Bacillus cereus*
- Yeast - Moulds analyzed together
- Yeast
- Moulds

1.4. EXECUTION OF ANALYZES

1.4.1 PRESERVATION TEMPERATURE OF SAMPLES BEFORE ANALYSIS

143 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **3.8°C** with a standard deviation of 0.7°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 2.0°C and the maximum one is 7.0°C.

Remark: Please note that samples must be conserved at 4°C on receipt, before analysis. They should not be frozen.

2. EXPLOITATION OF ANALYSIS REPORT

2.1. SIZE OF TEST SAMPLE

143 laboratories specified it.

The average size is **14.2 g** with a standard deviation of 7.1 g. The minimum size indicated is 5.0 g and the maximum one is 50.0 g.

2.2. PREPARATION OF THE INITIAL SUSPENSION

142 laboratories specified it.

139 laboratories prepare the initial suspension with adding diluent to gel.

3 laboratories prepare the initial suspension in another way.

2.3. DILUENT USED FOR THE INITIAL SUSPENSION

142 laboratories specified it.

130 laboratories use Buffered Peptone Water for the initial suspension.

9 laboratories use Peptone salt solution for the initial suspension.

3 laboratories used another diluent for the initial suspension.

2.4. HOMOGENIZATION TECHNIQUE

142 laboratories specified it.

134 laboratories homogenize their sampling with a StomacherND.

4 laboratories used a manual homogenization.

3 laboratories used a Vortex mixer.

1 laboratory used another technique.

The average duration is **2.3 min** with a standard deviation of 1.0 min. The data 15, 20, 30 and 35 min given by 9 laboratories were not taken into account for this calculation. The minimum duration indicated is 0.5 min and the maximum one is 5.0 min.

2.5. LACTIC ACID BACTERIA

110 laboratories performed the enumeration.

DELIVERY TIME OF SAMPLES / BEGINNING OF ANALYZES

110 laboratories specified it.

Analysis time	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+7	J0+8	J0+9	J0+10	J0+11	J0+14
Nb of laboratories	17	31	14	7	26	6	5	1	2	1

RESUSCITATION'S CONDITIONS

18 laboratories specified a duration of 0 min (or did not specify it) for the resuscitation step, they are not taken into account for the calculation.

- DURATION

92 laboratories specified it.

The average duration is **19.8 min** with a standard deviation of 12.5 min. The minimum duration indicated is 1 min and the maximum one is 60 min.

- TEMPERATURE

92 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **20.7°C** with a standard deviation of 2.7°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 4.0°C and the maximum one is 27.0°C.

The data 100 min given by 1 laboratory was not taken into account for this calculation.

Method	Nb laboratories
ISO / NF EN ISO 15214	79
NM ISO 15214	11
TEMPO LAB	8
AFNOR 3M 01/19-11/17	7
Other	4

Culture medium	Nb laboratories
MRS pH 5.7	88
TEMPO LAB	8
Petrifilm	7
MRS pH 6.4	7
Other	0

Preparation	Nb laboratories
Home made	24
Ready to use not pre-poured	69
Ready to use, plate, film, card	17

Plating method	Nb laboratories
Surface (agar plate, film)	16
Pour	86
Culture medium for card	8

Incubation temperature	Nb laboratories
30°C	108
37°C	2

Incubation duration	Nb laboratories
69 – 72 h	91
41 – 48.5 h	18
96 h	1

2.6. PSEUDOMONAS

76 laboratories performed the enumeration.

DELIVERY TIME OF SAMPLES / BEGINNING OF ANALYZES

76 laboratories specified it.

Analysis time	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+7	J0+8	J0+9	J0+10	J0+11	J0+14
Nb of laboratories	12	27	11	2	13	6	1	1	2	1

RESUSCITATION'S CONDITIONS

13 laboratories specified a duration of 0 min (or did not specify it) for the resuscitation step, they are not taken into account for the calculation.

- DURATION

63 laboratories specified it.

The average duration is **18.5 min** with a standard deviation of 11.3 min. The minimum duration indicated is 1 min and the maximum one is 60 min.

- TEMPERATURE

63 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **21.2°C** with a standard deviation of 3.0°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 10.3°C and the maximum one is 37.0°C.

The data 100 min given by 1 laboratory was not taken into account for this calculation.

Method	Nb laboratories
ISO / NF EN ISO 13720	48
AFNOR BKR 23/09-05/15	18
NM ISO 13720	7
Other	3

Incubation temperature	Nb laboratories
25°C	57
30°C	17
22-23°C	2

Culture medium	Nb laboratories
CFC	56
Rhapsody agar	18
Other	0

Incubation duration	Nb laboratories
44 - 48 h	72
41 – 43 h	2
72 h	2

Preparation	Nb laboratories
Home made	21
Ready to use not pre-poured	29
Ready to use, plate, film, card	26

Confirmation test	Nb laboratories
None	30
Oxydase	44
Other	1

2.7. BACILLUS CEREUS

114 laboratories performed the enumeration.

DELIVERY TIME OF SAMPLES / BEGINNING OF ANALYZES

114 laboratories specified it.

Analysis time	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+7	J0+8	J0+9	J0+10	J+11	J0+14
Nb of laboratories	15	36	15	4	28	8	4	2	1	1

RESUSCITATION'S CONDITIONS

16 laboratories specified a duration of 0 min (or did not specify it) for the resuscitation step, they are not taken into account for the calculation.

- DURATION

98 laboratories specified it.

The average duration is **21.0 min** with a standard deviation of 13.5 min. The minimum duration indicated is 1.0 min and the maximum one is 60.0 min.

- TEMPERATURE

98 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **21.2°C** with a standard deviation of 2.9°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 4°C and the maximum one is 30°C.

The data 100 min given by 1 laboratory was not taken into account for this calculation.

Method	Nb laboratories	Plating method	Nb laboratories
ISO / NF EN ISO 7932/A1	49	Surface (agar plate, film)	94
AFNOR BKR 23/06-02/10	25	Pour	11
AFNOR AES 10/10-07/10	19	Culture medium for card	5
NM ISO 7932	11		
Microval 2014LR47	5		
AFNOR BRD 07/26-03/19	2		
Other	1		
Culture medium	Nb laboratories	Incubation temperature	Nb laboratories
Mossel	61	30°C	113
COMPASS <i>Bacillus cereus</i> Agar	24	37°C	1
BACARA	20		
TEMPO BC	5		
RAPID'B. cereus	2		
Other	1		
Preparation	Nb laboratories	Incubation duration	Nb laboratories
Home made	23	21 – 24.5 h	66
Ready to use not pre-poured	13	45 – 48 h	44
Ready to use, plate, film, card	78	39 – 41 h	2
		18 h	2
Confirmation test	Nb laboratories		
None	57		
Biochemical (including hemolysis)	51		
Other	1		

2.8. YEAST / MOULDS

60 laboratories performed the enumeration.

DELIVERY TIME OF SAMPLES / BEGINNING OF ANALYZES

60 laboratories specified it.

Analysis time	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+7	J0+8	J0+9	J0+14
Nb of laboratories	9	18	10	6	11	4	1	1

RESUSCITATION'S CONDITIONS

8 laboratories specified a duration of 0 min (or did not specify it) for the resuscitation step, they are not taken into account for the calculation.

- DURATION

52 laboratories specified it.

The average duration is **19.2 min** with a standard deviation of 10.6 min. The minimum duration indicated is 1.0 min and the maximum one is 45.0 min.

- TEMPERATURE

52 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **21.5°C** with a standard deviation of 3.3°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 8.0°C and the maximum one 30.0°C.

The data 100 min given by 2 laboratories was not taken into account for this calculation.

Method	Nb laboratories	Preparation	Nb laboratories
NF V08-059	35	Home made	20
→ NM 08.0.123 ⁽¹⁾	4	Ready to use not pre-poured	32
AFNOR BKR 23/11-12/18	10	Ready to use, plate, film, card	8
AFNOR 3M 01/13-07/14	4		
ISO / NF ISO 21527-1	3		
NM ISO 21527-1	2		
Other	2		
Culture medium	Nb laboratories	Plating method	Nb laboratories
YGC	32	Surface (agar plate, film)	18
Symphony	11	Pour	42
Chloramphenicol glucose agar	6	Culture medium for card	0
OGA	4		
Petrifilm	4		
DRBC	1		
Other	1		
Incubation temperature	Nb laboratories	Incubation duration	Nb laboratories
23 - 25°C	55	112 - 120 h	40
30°C	3	70 - 72 h	17
20 - 22°C	2	96 h	2
		Other	1

⁽¹⁾ Similar method to NF V08-059 according to ONSSA (Office National de Sécurité Sanitaire des produits Alimentaires).

2.9. YEAST

62 laboratories performed the enumeration.

DELIVERY TIME OF SAMPLES / BEGINNING OF ANALYZES

61 laboratories specified it.

Analysis time	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+7	J0+8	J0+9	J0+10	J0+11
Nb of laboratories	9	16	7	6	14	5	2	1	1

RESUSCITATION'S CONDITIONS

10 laboratories specified a duration of 0 min (or did not specify it) for the resuscitation step, they are not taken into account for the calculation.

- DURATION

52 laboratories specified it.

The average duration is **22.8 min** with a standard deviation of 14.5 min. The minimum duration indicated is 1.0 min and the maximum one is 60.0 min.

- TEMPERATURE

52 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **21.3°C** with a standard deviation of 2.4°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 18.0°C and the maximum one is 30.0°C.

Method	Nb laboratories
NF V08-059	34
→ NM 08.0.123 ⁽¹⁾	6
AFNOR BKR 23/11-12/18	10
ISO / NF EN ISO 21527-1	6
AFNOR 3M 01/13-07/14	3
NM ISO 21527-1	1
Other	2

Preparation	Nb laboratories
Home made	13
Ready to use not pre-poured	41
Ready to use, plate, film, card	8
Plating method	Nb laboratories
Surface (agar plate, film)	17
Pour	41
Culture medium for card	0

Culture medium	Nb laboratories
YGC	25
Symphony	12
Chloramphenicol glucose agar	11
DRBC	5
OGA	5
Petrifilm	3
Other	1

Incubation temperature	Nb laboratories
23 - 25°C	58
20 - 22°C	3
30°C	1
Incubation duration	Nb laboratories
120 h	36
70 - 72 h	17
90 - 96 h	8
Other	1

⁽¹⁾ Similar method to NF V08-059 according to ONSSA (Office National de Sécurité Sanitaire des produits Alimentaires).

2.10. MOULDS

62 laboratories performed the enumeration.

DELIVERY TIME OF SAMPLES / BEGINNING OF ANALYZES

61 laboratories specified it.

Analysis time	J0+1	J0+2	J0+3	J0+4	J0+7	J0+8	J0+9	J0+10	J0+11
Nb of laboratories	9	16	7	6	14	5	2	1	1

RESUSCITATION'S CONDITIONS

10 laboratories specified a duration of 0 min (or did not specify it) for the resuscitation step, they are not taken into account for the calculation.

- DURATION

52 laboratories specified it.

The average duration is **22.8 min** with a standard deviation of 14.5 min. The minimum duration indicated is 1.0 min and the maximum one is 60.0 min.

- TEMPERATURE

52 laboratories specified it.

The average temperature is **21.3°C** with a standard deviation of 2.4°C. The minimum temperature indicated is 18.0°C and the maximum one is 30.0°C.

Method	Nb laboratories
NF V08-059	34
→ NM 08.0.123 ⁽¹⁾	6
AFNOR BKR 23/11-12/18	10
ISO / NF EN ISO 21527-1	6
AFNOR 3M 01/13-07/14	3
NM ISO 21527-1	1
Other	2

Culture medium	Nb laboratories
YGC	25
Symphony	12
Chloramphenicol glucose agar	11
DRBC	5
OGA	5
Petrifilm	3
Other	1

Preparation	Nb laboratories
Home made	13
Ready to use not pre-poured	41
Ready to use, plate, film, card	8

Plating method	Nb laboratories
Surface (agar plate, film)	17
Pour	41
Culture medium for card	0

Incubation temperature	Nb laboratories
23 - 25°C	58
20 - 22°C	3
30°C	1

Incubation duration	Nb laboratories
120 - 125 h	36
70 - 72 h	17
96 h	8
Other	1

⁽¹⁾ Similar method to NF V08-059 according to ONSSA (Office National de Sécurité Sanitaire des produits Alimentaires).

3. ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE (INDIVIDUEL REPORTS)

Performance is assessed on **trueness**.

The assigned value of the contamination used to assess the trueness is the consensual value obtained with the results of all the participants. This value is obtained by a robust estimation method in order to eliminate influence of aberrant results. However, some results are excluded of the statistical analysis. That is the case when laboratories do not give result for the contaminated unit, when results are "less than CFU/g", when samples are analyzed after the deadline (time of receipt > 4 days after sending or time of analysis >10 days after sending) or when this information is not specified.

A statistical analysis has also been done to highlight potential relations between techniques used (delay of analysis, preservation temperature, homogenization technique, resuscitation conditions, method used, media used, manufacturers of media, preparation mode, plating method, incubation conditions) and results obtained. We need to clarify that this statistical link is not involved in a cause - effect relationship. Indeed, this link may be due to a not documented factor.

When a significant statistical link is identified between use of a technique and the obtained results, the assessment of performance is done considering the influence of one or several factors involved if their effect translates into a contamination's difference higher than 0.15 log CFU/g for non-selective media or higher than 0.30 log CFU/g for selective media (these limits match with productivity limits of culture media usually recommended in the standard NF EN ISO 11133).

TRUENESS

The trueness reflects the closeness of your results to the contamination's assigned value of samples. It has been evaluated for all enumerated flora. Your result m_i is compared to the contamination's assigned value, X_{pt} , obtained with algorithm A from the standard ISO 13528 applied to all laboratories results included in the statistical analysis.

A z score is then calculated with the following formula : $z_i = \frac{m_i - X_{pt}}{\sigma_{pt}}$, where σ_{pt} is the standard deviation for proficiency assessment (robust estimation of the standard deviation obtained by participants). When groups are constituted, each one is characterized by its own contamination's assigned value.

The standard ISO 13528 specifies that z score included between -2 and +2 must be considered as satisfactory signal. A z score included between -2 and -3 or between +2 and +3 must be considered as a warning signal. A z score lower than -3 or higher than +3 must be considered as an action signal

INDIVIDUAL REPORTS – FOR EACH CRITERIA YOU FIND THE FOLLOWING INFORMATIONS

- your results in logarithm base 10 (-1 when the answer is < limit and NaN when there is no answer),
- histogram for the studied parameter (results of laboratories) with an asterisk indicating the location of your result,
- when necessary, your group in relation to the technique used,
- z score,
- number of laboratories which made analysis (and belonging to your group),
- number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis,
- assigned value of the contamination and standard deviation for proficiency assessment,
- number of laboratories with a satisfactory signal,
- number of laboratories with a warning signal,
- number of laboratories with an action signal.

3.1. LACTIC ACID BACTERIA

A significant “effect” of the culture medium, manufacturer, plating method and preparation has been highlighted. This effect results in a contamination’s difference lower than 0.3 log cfu/g, then results have been gathered in one group :

Lactic acid bacteria	
Number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis	103
Assigned value of the contamination (log cfu/g)	5.904
Uncertainty of assigned value (log cfu/g)	0.0410
Standard deviation for proficiency assessment (log cfu/g)	0.3329

3.2. PSEUDOMONAS

None significant effect of the analysis technique has been highlighted.

Pseudomonas	
Number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis	71
Assigned value of the contamination (log cfu/g)	3.954
Uncertainty of assigned value (log cfu/g)	0.0660
Standard deviation for proficiency assessment (log cfu/g)	0.4448

Comment : We specify that the homogeneity criterion is unsatisfactory for *Pseudomonas* enumeration. Inter-samples standard deviation has then been included in the calculation of standard deviation for proficiency assessment (ISO 13528 §B.2.5.a).

3.3. BACILLUS CEREUS

None significant effect of the analysis technique has been highlighted.

Bacillus cereus	
Number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis	109
Assigned value of the contamination (log cfu/g)	4.821
Uncertainty of assigned value (log cfu/g)	0.0309
Standard deviation for proficiency assessment (log cfu/g)	0.2581

3.4. YEAST / MOULDS

None significant effect of the analysis technique has been highlighted.

Yeast - Moulds	
Number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis	57
Assigned value of the contamination (log cfu/g)	4.009
Uncertainty of assigned value (log cfu/g)	0.0505
Standard deviation for proficiency assessment (log cfu/g)	0.3052

3.5. YEAST

None significant effect of the analysis technique has been highlighted.

Yeast	
Number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis	57
Assigned value of the contamination (log cfu/g)	3.906
Uncertainty of assigned value (log cfu/g)	0.0569
Standard deviation for proficiency assessment (log cfu/g)	0.3438

Comment : We specify that the homogeneity criterion is unsatisfactory for Yeast enumeration. Inter-samples standard deviation has then been included in the calculation of standard deviation for proficiency assessment (ISO 13528 §B.2.5.a).

3.6. MOULDS

None significant effect of the analysis technique has been highlighted.

Moulds	
Number of laboratories included in the statistical analysis	57
Assigned value of the contamination (log cfu/g)	3.601
Uncertainty of assigned value (log cfu/g)	0.0245
Standard deviation for proficiency assessment (log cfu/g)	0.1479

3.7. EVOLUTION OF PERFORMANCE

You will find, at the end of the individual report, graphs representing evolution of your performance on different tests since the 61A scheme.

In order to interpret your control card with z scores, you can refer to the standard ISO 13528 §10.8.2.2, explaining the 3 « out of control » situations :

- Just one overtaking of the action limit ($z < -3$ or $z > 3$),
- 2 consecutives z scores out of 3 overtaking of the warning limit ($2 < z < 3$ or $-3 < z < -2$),
- 6 consecutives z scores either positive or negative.